

Philosophical Foundations of Neuroscience

by

M. R. Bennett and P. M. S. Hacker

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	xiii
Acknowledgements	xvii
Introduction	1
PART 1	
PHILOSOPHICAL PROBLEMS IN NEUROSCIENCE: THEIR HISTORICAL AND CONCEPTUAL ROOTS	9
CHAPTER 1 THE EARLY GROWTH OF NEUROSCIENTIFIC KNOWLEDGE: THE INTEGRATIVE ACTION OF THE NERVOUS SYSTEM	11
1.1 Aristotle, Galen and Nemesius: the origins of the ventricular doctrine	12
1.2 Fernel and Descartes: the demise of the ventricular doctrine	23
1.3 The cortical doctrine of Willis and its aftermath	30
1.4 The conception of a reflex: Bell, Magendie and Marshall Hall	33
1.5 Localizing function in the cortex: Broca, Fritz and Hitzig	38
1.6 The integrative action of the nervous system: Sherrington	41
CHAPTER 2 THE CORTEX AND THE MIND IN THE WORK OF SHERRINGTON AND HIS PROTEGES	
2.1 Charles Sherrington: the continuing Cartesian impact	43
2.2 Edgar Adrian: hesitant Cartesianism	47
2.3 John Eccles and the 'liaison brain'	49
2.4 Wilder Penfield and the 'highest brain mechanism'	57

CHAPTER 3 THE MEREOLOGICAL FALLACY IN NEUROSCIENCE	68
3.1 Mereological confusions in cognitive neuroscience (<i>Crick, Edelman, Blakemore, Young, Frisby, Gregory, Marr, Johnson-Laird</i>)	68
3.2 Methodological qualms (<i>Ullman, P.S. Churchland, Blakemore, Zeki, Young, Milner Squire and Kandel, Marr, Frisby, Sperry</i>)	74
3.3 On the grounds for ascribing psychological predicates to a being (<i>Crick, Baars</i>)	81
3.4 On the grounds for misascribing psychological predicates to an inner entity (<i>Damasio, Edelman and Tononi, Kosslyn and Ochsner, Searle, James, Libet, Humphrey, Blakemore, Crick</i>)	85
3.5 The inner (<i>Damasio</i>)	88
3.6 Introspection (<i>Humphrey, Johnson-Laird, Weiskrantz</i>)	90
3.7 Privileged access: direct and indirect (<i>Blakemore</i>)	92
3.8 Privacy or subjectivity (<i>Searle</i>)	94
3.9 The meaning of psychological predicates and how they are learnt (<i>Searle</i>)	97
3.10 Of the mind and its nature (<i>Gazzaniga, Doty</i>)	103
PART II HUMAN FACULTIES AND CONTEMPORARY NEUROSCIENCE: AN ANALYSIS	109
PRELIMINARIES	111
1. Brain-body dualism (<i>Kandel Schwartz and Jessell, Libet</i>)	111
2. The project (<i>Gazzaniga</i>)	114
3. The category of the psychological (<i>Nagel, P.M. Churchland and P.S. Churchland</i>)	117

CHAPTER 4 SENSATION AND PERCEPTION	121
4.1 Sensation (<i>Searle, Libet, Geldard and Sherrick</i>)	121
4.2 Perception (<i>Crick</i>)	125
4.2.1 Perception as the causation of sensations: primary and secondary qualities (<i>Kandel, Schwartz and Jessell, Rock</i>)	128
4.2.2 Perception as hypothesis formation: Helmholtz (<i>Helmholtz, Gregory, Glynn, Young</i>)	135
4.2.3 Visual images and the binding problem (<i>Sherrington, Damasio, Edelman, Crick, Kandel and Wurtz, Gray and Singer, Barlow</i>)	137
4.2.4 Perception as information processing: Marr's theory of vision (<i>Marr, Frisby, Crick, Ullman</i>)	143
CHAPTER 5 THE COGNITIVE POWERS	148
5.1 Knowledge and its kinship with ability	148
5.11 <i>Being able to</i> and <i>Knowing how to</i>	149
5.12 Possessing knowledge and containing knowledge (<i>LeDoux, Young, Zeki, Blakemore, Crick, Gazzaniga</i>)	151
5.2 Memory (<i>Milner, Squire and Kandel</i>)	154
5.21 Declarative and non-declarative memory (<i>Milner Squire and Kandel</i>)	155
5.22 Storage, retention and memory traces (<i>LeDoux, Squire and Kandel; Gazzaniga Mangun and Ivry; James, Köhler, Glynn; Bennett Gibson and Robinson, Damasio</i>)	158
CHAPTER 6 THE COGITATIVE POWERS	172
6.1 Belief (<i>Crick</i>)	172
6.2 Thinking	175

6.3	Imagination and mental images <i>(Blakemore, Posner and Raichle, Shepard)</i>	180
6.3.1	The logical features of mental imagery <i>(Galton, Richardson, Kosslyn and Ochsner, Finke, Luria, Shepard, Meudell, Betts, Marks, Shepard and Metzler, Cooper and Shepard, Posner and Raichle)</i>	187
CHAPTER 7 EMOTION		199
7.1	Affections <i>(Rolls, Damasio)</i>	199
7.2	The emotions: a preliminary analytical survey	203
7.2.1	Neuroscientists' confusions <i>(LeDoux, Damasio, James)</i>	207
7.2.2	Analysis of the emotions	216
CHAPTER 8 VOLITION AND VOLUNTARY MOVEMENT		224
8.1	Volition	224
8.2	Libet's theory of voluntary movement <i>(Libet, Frith et al.)</i>	228
8.3	Taking stock	231
PART III CONSCIOUSNESS AND CONTEMPORARY NEUROSCIENCE: AN ANALYSIS		237
CHAPTER 9 INTRANSITIVE AND TRANSITIVE CONSCIOUSNESS		239
9.1	Consciousness and the brain <i>(Albright, Jessell, Kandel and Posner, Edelman and Tononi; Glynn, Greenfield, Llinás, Gazzaniga, Searle, Johnson-Laird, Chalmers, Dennett, Gregory, Crick and Koch, Frisby)</i>	239
9.2	Intransitive consciousness <i>(Searle, Dennett)</i>	244
9.3	Transitive consciousness and its forms	248
9.4	Transitive consciousness — a partial analysis	253

CHAPTER 10 CONSCIOUS EXPERIENCE, MENTAL STATES AND QUALIA	261
10.1 Extending the concept of consciousness (<i>Libet, Baars, Crick, Edelman, Searle, Chalmers</i>)	261
10.2 Conscious experience and conscious mental states	263
10.2.1 Confusions regarding unconscious belief and unconscious activities of the brain (<i>Searle, Baars</i>)	268
10.3 Qualia (<i>Searle, Chalmers, Glynn, Damasio, Edelman and Tononi, Nagel, Dennett</i>)	271
10.3.1 'How it feels' to have an experience (<i>Searle, Edelman and Tononi, Chalmers, Damasio</i>)	274
10.3.2 Of there being <i>something which it is like ...</i> (<i>Nagel</i>)	277
10.3.3 The qualitative character of experience	281
10.3.4 <i>Thises and thuses</i> (<i>Chalmers, Crick</i>)	282
10.3.5 Of the communicability and describability of qualia (<i>Nagel, Edelman, Glynn, Sperry</i>)	284
CHAPTER 11 PUZZLES ABOUT CONSCIOUSNESS	293
11.1 A budget of puzzles	293
11.2 Reconciling consciousness or subjectivity with our conception of an objective reality (<i>Searle, Chalmers, Dennett, Penrose</i>)	294
11.3 On the question of how physical processes can give rise to conscious experience (<i>Huxley, Tyndall, Humphrey, Glynn, Edelman, Damasio</i>)	302
11.4 Of the evolutionary value of consciousness (<i>Chalmers, Barlow, Penrose, Humphrey, Searle</i>)	307
11.5 The problem of awareness (<i>Johnson-Laird, Blakemore</i>)	314
11.6 Other minds and other animals (<i>Crick, Edelman, Weiskrantz, Baars</i>)	316

CHAPTER 12 SELF-CONSCIOUSNESS	323
12.1 Self-consciousness and the self	323
12.2 Historical stage-setting: Descartes, Locke, Hume, James	324
12.3 Current scientific and neuroscientific reflections on the nature of self-consciousness (<i>Damasio, Edelman, Humphrey, Blakemore, Johnson-Laird</i>)	328
12.4 The illusion of a 'self' (<i>Damasio, Humphrey, Blakemore</i>)	331
12.5 The horizon of thought, will and affection	334
12.51 Thought and language (<i>Damasio, Edelman and Tononi, Galton, Penrose</i>)	337
12.6 Self-consciousness (<i>Edelman, Penrose</i>)	346
PART IV ON METHOD	353
CHAPTER 13 REDUCTIONISM	355
13.1 Ontological and explanatory reductionism (<i>Crick, Blakemore</i>)	355
13.2 Reduction by elimination (<i>P.M. and P.S. Churchland</i>)	366
13.2.1 Are our ordinary psychological concepts theoretical? (<i>P.M. Churchland</i>)	367
13.2.2 Are everyday generalizations about human psychology laws of a theory? (<i>P. M. Churchland</i>)	370
13.2.3 Eliminating all that is human (<i>P.M. and P.S. Churchland, Dawkins</i>)	372
13.2.4 On sawing off the branch on which one sits	376
CHAPTER 14 METHODOLOGICAL REFLECTIONS	378
14.1 Linguistic inertia and conceptual innovation (<i>P.S. Churchland</i>)	379

14.2 The ‘poverty of English’ argument (<i>Blakemore</i>)	386
14.3 From nonsense to sense: the proper description of the results of commissurotomy (<i>Crick, Sperry, Gazzaniga, Wolford Miller and Gazzaniga, Doty</i>)	388
14.3.1 The case of blindsight: misdescription and illusory explanation (<i>Weiskrantz</i>)	393
14.4 Philosophy and neuroscience (<i>Glynn, Edelman, Edelman and Tononi, Crick, Zeki</i>)	396
14.4.1 What philosophy can and what it cannot do	399
14.4.2 What neuroscience can and what it cannot do (<i>Crick, Edelman, Zeki</i>)	405
14.5 Why it matters	408
APPENDICES	411
Appendix 1 Daniel Dennett	413
1. Dennett’s methodology and presuppositions	415
2. The intentional stance	419
3. Heterophenomenological method	427
4. Consciousness	431
Appendix 2 John Searle	436
1. Philosophy and science	436
2. Searle’s philosophy of mind	443
3. The traditional mind-body problem	449
INDEX	453